LOUISIANA LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 32

1971-1972

LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70803

LOUISIANA LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 32
1971-1972

CONTENTS

Issue Number 1

ARTICLES

Validity of Patents Conveying Navigable Waterbottoms—Act 62 of 1912, Price, Carter, and All That *A. N. Yiannopoulos* 1

Ship's Liability to Longshoremen Based on Unseaworthiness—Sieracki Through Usner *James A. George* 19

The Shreveport Plan for Prepaid Legal Services—A Unique Experiment *Robert Roberts, Jr.* 45

COMMENTS

The Uniform Controlled Dangerous Substances Act: An Expositive Review *Vance R. Andrus and Charles R. Moore* 56

Double Jeopardy—Defining the Same Offense *W. John English, Jr.* 87

The Tying Contract and Its Treatment by the Federal Courts: A Critical Analysis *Jerald L. Perlman* 102

Usufructuary Taxation—Avoiding the Zero Basis *J. Edgerton Pierson, Jr.* 122

NOTES

The Juvenile Jury Trial Case—A Regrettable "Policy Decision" (*McKeiver v. Pennsylvania*, U.S. 1971) *Lawrence Roe Dodd* 133

Double Jeopardy—Declaration of Mistrial Without Consent of Defendant (*United States v. Jorn*, U. S. 1971) *Carl Grant Schlueter* 145

Applicability of Article 1592 to the Statutory Will (*Woodfork v. Sanders*, La. 1971) *W. Marshall Shaw* 153

An Unloaded and Unworkable Pistol as a Dangerous Weapon When Used in a Robbery (*State v. Levi*, La. 1971) *Wilson R. Ramshur* 158

Issue Number 2

ARTICLES

The Work of the Louisiana Appellate Courts for the 1970-1971 Term *Faculty Symposium* 165

Private Law 165
- Persons 165
- Property 172
- Successions and Donations 200
- Torts 213
- Matrimonial Regimes 219
- Particular Contracts 228
- Mandate 231
- Partnership 232
- Security Devices 233
- Prescription 250
- Mineral Rights 254
- Corporations 267
- Insurance 267

Public Law 271
- Administrative Regulation: Law and Procedure 271
- Bankruptcy 291
- Conflict of Laws 295
- Criminal Law 298
- Modern Social Legislation 306
- State and Local Government 308
- State and Local Taxation 311

Procedure 315
Civil Procedure
Partial Judgments 315
Selected Topics 318
Criminal Procedure 334
Evidence 344

NOTE

State v. Barnes—Procedural Technicalities or Justice? (*State v. Barnes*, La. 1971) *J. Kirby Barry* 360

Issue Number 3

ARTICLES

The Standards of Criminal Justice in a Nutshell *William H. Erickson* 369

Pledge or Mortgage of Immovable Property as Proper Security for a Suspensive Appeal *Carey J. Guglielmo and Sidney M. Blitzer, Jr.* 408

COMMENTS

Sale or Lease: Capital Gain or Ordinary Income Subject to Depletion in Mineral Transactions *Chris A. Verret* 417

Uninsured Motorist Coverage in Louisiana *Edwin K. Theus, Jr.* 431

NOTES

When Is a Sale a Sale? (*Kegler's, Inc. v. Levy*, La. 1970) *John Franklin Weeks* 446

Louisiana's Statutory Will: The Role of Formal Requirements (*Succession of Gordon*, La. 1971) *Lemuel E. Hawsey, III* 452

Constitutional Law—Equal Protection and the Closing of Public Facilities (*Palmer v. Thompson*, U.S. 1971) *W. Michael Adams* 462

Federal Tax Liability of the Wife for Community Income Earned by the Husband (*United States v. Mitchell*, U.S. 1971) *Warner H. Anthony, Jr.* 471

Limitations on the Effect of the Express Offset Clause and a Suggested Duty to Unitize (*Williams v. Humble Oil & Refining Co.*, U. S. 1970) *Robert J. Prejeant* 478

BOOK NOTE

A Reprint of Moreau Lislet's Copy of *A Digest of the Civil Laws Now in Force in the Territory of Orleans* (1808), Containing Manuscript References to Its Sources and Other Civil Laws on the Same Subjects (*The de la Vergne Volume*). Second reprinting with additions, Claitor's Publishing Division, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 1971. $25.00 *Robert A. Pascal* 495

Issue Number 4

IN MEMORIAM (BEVERLY DENBO WALKER) iii

ARTICLES

Protection of a Businessman's Proprietary Information *Julian Clark Martin and Jack R. Springgate* 497

Highlights of the Mineral Code Recommendations: A Guide to the More Important Suggested Changes and Elaborations *George W. Hardy, III* 542

COMMENTS

Federal Injunctive Relief Against State Court Criminal Proceedings: From Young to Younger *S. Gene Fendler* 601

Standing and Administrative Agencies—Expanding Concepts of Judicial Review *John F. Weeks* 634

NOTE

Harris v. New York: The Retreat from Miranda (*Harris v. New York*, U.S. 1971) *William Craig Henry* 650

GENERAL INDEX

VOLUME 32

ACTIONS AND OTHER PROCEEDINGS

Real actions,
  Protection of immovable real rights, Possessory action, Vol. 32, p. 188

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW AND PROCEDURE

Department of highways, Vol. 32, p. 287
Louisiana milk commission, Vol. 32, p. 289
School boards and school associations, Vol. 32, p. 284
Standing,
  Environmental Litigation, Vol. 32, p. 640
  History, Vol. 32, p. 635
State bank commissioner, Vol. 32, p. 286
State market commission, Vol. 32, p. 288
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
  1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 271

ADMIRALTY

Longshoremen,
  Protection through warranty of seaworthiness, Vol. 32, p. 19
Ship's liability to longshoremen based on unseaworthiness,
  Defenses, Vol. 32, p. 37
  Effect of violations of longshoring regulations upon comparative negligence defense, Vol. 32, p. 33
  "Loading," defined, Vol. 32, p. 2

ALIMONY

Conflict of laws, Vol. 32, p. 295
Enforcement of award, Vol. 32, p. 165

ANTI-TRUST

Tying contract, Vol. 32, p. 102

APPEALS

Pledge or mortgage as proper security for a suspensive appeal, Vol. 32, p. 408

ATTORNEYS

Prepaid legal services, Vol. 32, p. 45

BANKRUPTCY

Discharge,
  Effect of, Vol. 32, p. 291
Promise to pay discharged debt, Vol. 32, p. 295
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
  1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 291

BENNETT, DALE E.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
  1970-1971 term, criminal procedure, Vol. 32, p. 334

BLITZER, SIDNEY M., JR.

Pledge or mortgage of immovable property as proper security for a suspensive appeal, Vol. 32, p. 408

CIVIL SERVICE

Commission,
  Appeal from decisions, Vol. 32, p. 276
  Limited review of decisions, Vol. 32, p. 277
  Review of dismissal, Vol. 32, p. 275
  Right to set pay scales, Vol. 32, p. 280
Employees,
  Grounds for dismissal, Vol. 32, p. 276
  Procedure for dismissal, Vol. 32, p. 277

COMMUNITY PROPERTY

Nature of wife's interest during the community, Vol. 32, p. 471
Tax liability of wife after renunciation, Vol. 32, p. 471

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Alimony, Vol. 32, p. 295
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
  1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 295

CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES

Declaratory judgment,
  Federal relief against state court criminal proceedings, Vol. 32, p. 620

Double jeopardy,
Declaration of mistrial without consent of defendant, Vol. 32, p. 145
Same offense,
Collateral estoppel theory, Vol. 32, p. 92
Equal protection of law,
Closing of public facilities, Vol. 32, p. 462
Injunctive relief,
Federal relief against state court criminal proceedings, Vol. 32, p. 601
Jury trials,
Right to jury trial for juvenile, Vol. 32, p. 133

COPYRIGHT LAW

Federal copyright act and common law copyright, Vol. 32, p. 503
Protection of a businessman's proprietary information, Vol. 32, p. 497

CORPORATIONS

Parole evidence, Vol. 32, p. 267
Share subscriptions,
Use of mandamus to compel delivery of shares, Vol. 32, p. 267
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 267

CRAWFORD, WILLIAM E.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, civil procedure, Vol. 32, p. 315; torts, Vol. 32, p. 213

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Appellate review of sentences, Vol. 32, p. 399
Bill of exceptions, role of Art. 844 of Code of Criminal Procedure, Vol. 32, p. 360
Burglary, Vol. 32, p. 302
Closing arguments, penalty considerations, Vol. 32, p. 342
Comment on failure of defendant's spouse to testify, Vol. 32, p. 341
Concealed weapons, Vol. 32, p. 305
Confessions,
Use for impeachment, Vol. 32, p. 650
Criminal appeals, Vol. 32, p. 397
Dangerous weapon, Vol. 32, pp. 158, 298
Discovery and procedure before trial, Vol. 32, p. 381
Double jeopardy,
Declaration of mistrial without consent of defendant, Vol. 32, p. 145
Same offense,
Collateral estoppel, theory, Vol. 32, p. 92
Electronic surveillance, Vol. 32, p. 380
Fair trial and free press, Vol. 32, p. 377
Function of prosecution and defense, Vol. 32, p. 402
Function of trial judge, Vol. 32, p. 404
Increased sentence upon re-conviction, Vol. 32, p. 343
Indigent's right to court-appointed counsel, Vol. 32, p. 336
Insanity, Vol. 32, p. 304
Joinder and severance, Vol. 32, p. 386
Narcotics, Vol. 32, p. 306
Neglect of family, Vol. 32, p. 165
Pleas of guilty, Vol. 32, p. 383
Post-conviction remedies, Vol. 32, p. 400
Pretrial release, Vol. 32, p. 376
Probation, Vol. 32, p. 395
Providing defense services, Vol. 32, p. 374
Questioning, detention on suspicion, Vol. 32, p. 334
Rape, Vol. 32, p. 300
Robbery, Vol. 32, p. 304
Search incidental to arrest, Vol. 32, p. 335
Sentencing alternatives and procedures, Vol. 32, p. 393
Sequestration of witnesses, Vol. 32, p. 338
Speedy trial, Vol. 32, p. 389
Theft of partnership property, Vol. 32, p. 303
Trial by jury, Vol. 32, p. 390
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, pp. 298, 334

CURRIE, HECTOR

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, bankruptcy, Vol. 32, p. 291

DAINOW, JOSEPH

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 Term, prescription, Vol. 32, p. 250

DAKIN, MELVIN G.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,

1970-1971 term, administrative regulation, law and procedure, Vol. 32, p. 271; state and local government Vol. 32, p. 308; state and local taxation, Vol. 32, p. 311

ELLIS, FREDERICK W.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, criminal law, Vol. 32, p. 298

ERICKSON, WILLIAM H.

The standards of criminal justice in a nutshell, Vol. 32, p. 369

EVIDENCE

Bill of exceptions, generally, Vol. 32, p. 358
Confessions,
Use for Impeachment, Vol. 32, p. 650
Confrontation and compulsory process, generally, Vol. 32, p. 351
Expert testimony,
Chiropractors and unlicensed physicians, Vol. 32, p. 348
Hearsay,
Generally, Vol. 32, p. 352
Admissions, civil cases, Vol. 32, p. 355
Admissions, criminal cases, Vol. 32, p. 356
Res gestae, Vol. 32, p. 356
Impeachment,
Prior inconsistent statements, Vol. 32, p. 348
Testimony given before a grand jury, Vol. 32, p. 347
Photographs and pictures,
Admissibility of gruesome color pictures, Vol. 32, p. 351
Relevancy,
Gruesome photographs, Vol. 32, p. 351
Other crimes, Vol. 32, p. 349
Res gestae, Vol. 32, p. 356
Search and seizure, generally, Vol. 32, p. 357
Witnesses,
Examination of witnesses, responsiveness, Vol. 32, p. 344
Scope of cross-examination, Vol. 32, p. 345
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 344

FREE ENTERPRISE

Protection of proprietary information, Vol. 32, p. 497

GEORGE, JAMES A.

Ship's liability to longshoremen based on unseaworthiness — Sieracki through Usner, Vol. 32, p. 19

GUGLIELMO, CAREY J.

Pledge or mortgage of immovable property as proper security for a suspensive appeal, Vol. 32, p. 408

HARDY, GEORGE W. III

Mineral code recommendations, Vol. 32, p. 542
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, mineral rights, Vol. 32, p. 254

HARGRAVE, LEE

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, persons, Vol. 32, p. 165

HARRISON, MILTON M.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, corporations, Vol. 32, p. 267; mandate, Vol. 32, p. 231; partnership, Vol. 32, p. 232

HUSBAND AND WIFE

Obligation of support, Vol. 32, p. 165
Tax liability of wife after renunciation of community, Vol. 32, p. 471

IMMOVABLES

Classification, Vol. 32, p. 173
Nature, immovable by, Vol. 32, p. 173

INJUNCTIONS

Federal injunctive relief against state court criminal proceedings, Vol. 32, p. 601

INSURANCE

Direct action statute,
Immunity of son to suit by father, Vol. 32, p. 270
Fire,
Measure of recovery in event of partial loss, Vol. 32, p. 268
Prescription following ascertainment of loss, Vol. 32, p. 268
Insurer's right to settle,
Burden of proving reasonableness, Vol. 32, p. 271
Uninsured motorist coverage,
Credit for workmen's compensation benefits, Vol. 32, p. 269
Hit-and-run coverage, Vol. 32, p. 435

Initial requirements for coverage, Vol. 32, p. 432
Limitations on the uninsured motorist provision, Vol. 32, p. 443
Prescription, Vol. 32, p. 437
Recovery for damages caused by joint tortfeasors, Vol. 32, p. 442
Who pays?—coverage by more than one insurer, Vol. 32, p. 440
Who pays?—Insured v. uninsured motorist, Vol. 32, p. 438
War exclusion clauses, Vol. 32, p. 269
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 267

JURISDICTION

Civil procedure,
Jurisdiction in personam over nonresidents, Vol. 32, p. 321
Jurisdiction over the subject matter, Vol. 32, p. 318

JUVENILE COURT

Juvenile jury trial, Vol. 32, p. 133

LAZARUS, CARLOS E.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, successions and donations, Vol. 32, p. 200

L'ENFANT, HOWARD W., JR.

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, civil procedure, Vol. 32, p. 318

LE VAN, GERALD

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, security devices, Vol. 32, p. 233

McKENZIE, SHELBY

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, insurance, Vol. 32, p. 267

MANDATE

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 231

MARTIN, JULIAN CLARK

Protection of a businessman's proprietary information, Vol. 32, p. 497

MATRIMONIAL REGIMES

Action for damages suffered by the husband, Vol. 32, p. 219
Obligations incurred by the wife, Vol. 32, p. 223
Partition on dissolution, Vol. 32, p. 228
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 219

MINERALS, OIL AND GAS

Conservation,
Review of commissioner's orders, Vol. 32, p. 266
Depletion, economic interest in minerals, Vol. 32, p. 417
Mineral code recommendations, Vol. 32, p. 542
Mineral leases,
Express clause,
Commencement of operations, Vol. 32, p. 258
Default in rent, Vol. 32, p. 259
Releases, Vol. 32, p. 260
Express offset clause, Vol. 32, p. 479
Farm-out agreements, Vol. 32, p. 265
Implied covenants,
Unitization, Vol. 32, p. 261
Sale of working interest, Vol. 32, p. 417
Working interest transactions, Vol. 32, p. 263
Mineral royalties,
Prescription, Vol. 32, p. 257
Mineral servitudes,
Prescription, unit operations, Vol. 32, p. 254
Unitization, possibility of duty, Vol. 32, p. 488
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 254

NARCOTICS

Criminal law, Vol. 32, p. 306
Uniform Controlled Dangerous Substances Act, Vol. 32, p. 56

PARENT AND CHILD

Parental obligation of support, Vol. 32, p. 165

PARTICULAR CONTRACTS

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 228

PARTNERSHIP

Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 232

PASCAL, ROBERT A.
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, conflict of laws, Vol. 32, p. 295; matrimonial regimes, Vol. 32, p. 219

PATENT LAW
Federal patent law, Vol. 32, p. 497
Protection of a businessman's proprietary information, Vol. 32, p. 497

PERSONS
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 165

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE
Cumulation of actions, Vol. 32, p. 328
Jurisdiction over non-residents,
In personam, Vol. 32, p. 321
Jurisdiction over subject matter, Vol. 32, p. 318
Motion for a new trial, Vol. 32, p. 330
Non-resident, attachment, Vol. 32, p. 325
Partial judgments, Vol. 32, p. 315
Service of process on a non-resident, Vol. 32, p. 324
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, pp. 315, 318

PRESCRIPTION
Acquisitive prescription,
Founded on conveyance by wife of community immovables, Vol. 32, p. 250
Liberative prescription, Vol. 32, p. 252
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 250

PROPERTY
Avulsion, Vol. 32, p. 178
Building restrictions,
Effect of zoning restricted property, Vol. 32, p. 190
Interpretation of, Vol. 32, p. 191
Termination, Vol. 32, p. 192
Water bottoms, Vol. 32, pp. 1, 172
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 172

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
Certificates of convenience and necessity, Vol. 32, p. 271
Duplication of utility service, Vol. 32, p. 273
Railroads, relocation of spurs, Vol. 32, p. 274
Rate-making method, Vol. 32, p. 274
Rate regulation,
Jurisdiction, Vol. 32, p. 272

PUGH, GEORGE W.
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, evidence, Vol. 32, p. 344

REAL RIGHTS
Vendor's privileges, Vol. 32, p. 176

ROBERTS, ROBERT, JR.
The Shreveport plan for prepaid legal services—a unique experiment, Vol. 32, p. 45

SALES
Compared with other contracts, Vol. 32, p. 446

SCHROEDER, LEILA O.
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, modern social legislation, Vol. 32, p. 306

SECURITY DEVICES
Attorney's fees in contract litigation, Vol. 32, p. 246
Construction on the outer continental shelf—application of the Louisiana Private Works Act and Oil Well Act, Vol. 32, p. 247
Mortgages,
Security for future advances, Vol. 32, p. 233
Security for suspensive appeal, Vol. 32, p. 408
Pledge,
Private sale of pledged stock, Vol. 32, p. 250
Security for suspensive appeal, Vol. 32, p. 408
Private works act, R.S. 9:4801-4842, Vol. 32, p. 241
Privileges and liens,
Single lien period, Vol. 32, p. 244
Vendor's privileges, real rights, Vol. 32, p. 176
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 233

SERVITUDES
Enclosed estate, passage, Vol. 32, p. 181
Highways, roads and streets, Vol. 32, p. 187
Sic utere servitude, Vol. 32, p. 183

SMITH, J. DENSON
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, particular contracts, Vol. 32, p. 228

SOCIAL LEGISLATION
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 306

SPRINGGATE, JACK R.
Protection of a businessman's proprietary information, Vol. 32, p. 497

STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 308
Zoning, Vol. 32, p. 308

STATE AND LOCAL TAXATION
Assessments, Vol. 32, p. 311
Sales and use taxes, Vol. 32, p. 312
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 311

SUCCESSIONS
Cumulation of rights under art. 916 and testament, Vol. 32, p. 194
Testamentary Dispositions,
Excessive donations, reduction by creditors, Vol. 32, p. 210
Prohibited substitutions, Vol. 32, p. 207
Usufruct of the surviving spouse, Vol. 32, p. 204
Usufruct, of surviving spouse, Vol. 32, p. 194
Validity of testaments, Vol. 32, p. 201
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 200

TAXATION
Income tax,
Capital gains treatment in mineral transactions, Vol. 32, p. 417
Depletion allowance, economic interest in minerals, Vol. 32, p. 417
Sale v. lease in mineral transactions, Vol. 32, p. 417
Usufructuary taxation—avoiding the zero basis, Vol. 32, p. 122

TESTAMENTS
Date, generally, Vol. 32, p. 201
Olographic, date, uncertainty of, Vol. 32, p. 201
Statutory will,
Applicability of article 1592, Vol. 32, p. 153
Formal validity, Vol. 32, pp. 201, 452

TORTS
Contributory Negligence, Vol. 32, p. 213
Latent Brake Failure, Vol. 32, p. 214
Scope of statutory duty, Vol. 32, p. 216
Vicarious responsibility, non-imputation of negligence, Vol. 32, p. 219
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, Vol. 32, p. 213

UNEMPLOYMENT COMPENSATION
Modern social legislation, Vol. 32, p. 306

USUFRUCT
Confirmation of legal, Vol. 32, p. 194
Corporate stock, perfect usufruct, Vol. 32, p. 194
Creation of, Vol. 32, p. 193
Imperfect usufruct, Vol. 32, p. 194
Usufruct of surviving spouse, Vol. 32, p. 194
Usufructuary taxation—avoiding the zero basis, Vol. 32, p. 122
Validity of bequests in, Vol. 32, p. 193

YIANNOPOULOS, A. N.
Validity of patents conveying navigable waterbottoms—Act 62 of 1912, Price, Carter, and all that, Vol. 32, p. 1
Work of the Louisiana appellate courts,
1970-1971 term, property, Vol. 32, p. 172

ZONING
State and local government, Vol. 32, p. 308